

Child Maltreatment-Related Service Decisions by Ethno-Racial Categories in Ontario in 2013

Barbara Fallon, Tara Black, Melissa Van Wert, Bryn King, Joanne Filippelli, Barbara Lee, Brenda Moody

Introduction

The Ontario Incidence Study of Reported Child and Neglect-2013 is the fifth provincial study examining the incidence of reported child abuse and neglect in Ontario. The OIS-2013 captured information about children and their families as they came into contact with child welfare services over a three-month sampling period. Information was collected directly from the investigating workers at the conclusion of the investigation. Along with other information, the ethno-racial status of the child was collected. The purpose of this fact sheet is to examine ethno-racial disproportionality and disparities in child welfare investigation and service decisions using the OIS-2013 data.

The child welfare statute in Ontario requires professionals working with children and the general public report all situations where they have concerns that a child may have been maltreated or where there is a risk of maltreatment (see <http://www.canlii.org/en/on/laws/stat/rso-1990-c-c11/97652/rso-1990-c-c11.html>). Child welfare authorities are responsible for investigating allegations of possible maltreatment, determining whether the allegations are substantiated, and providing services to children and families to address the consequences of abuse and neglect and prevent future maltreatment. The OIS captures clinical information about the child, caregivers, and households, as well as key service decisions such as substantiation, case transfer, use of court, and placement in out-of-home care. The OIS uses a three-tiered classification system for investigated incidents of maltreatment, in which substantiation is used to measure whether in the clinical judgment of a worker the child has been a victim of maltreatment. At the conclusion of a maltreatment investigation, the OIS also requires that workers report whether the investigation has been transferred to ongoing services and whether they have placed a child in out of home care.

Methodology

The OIS-2013 used a multi-stage sampling design to select a representative sample of 17 child welfare agencies in Ontario and then to select a sample of cases within these agencies. The OIS collects information about children who are investigated for a

maltreatment-related concern. For the purposes of this analysis, a sample of children age 0-14 years of age who were investigated for a maltreatment-related concern was used to calculate the incidence of investigation using the ethno-racial categories contained in the National Household Survey 2011.

Information was collected directly from child protection workers on a representative sample of 4,961 child protection investigations conducted during the fall of 2013. This sample was weighted to reflect provincial annual estimates. After two weighting procedures were applied to the data, the estimated number of maltreatment-related investigations (i.e., maltreatment and risk-only investigations) conducted in Ontario in 2013 was 118,011 maltreatment related investigations involving children 14 years of age and under.

Study Limitations

As with any sample survey, estimates must be understood within the constraints of the survey instruments, the sampling design, and the estimation procedures used (see Methodology Chapter 2 of OIS-2013; Fallon et al., 2015).

- the weights used to derive annual estimates include counts of children investigated more than once during the year, therefore the unit of analysis for the weighted estimates is a child investigation;
- the OIS tracks information during approximately the first 30 days of case activity; service outcomes such as out of home placements only include events that occurred during those first approximately 30 days
- the study does not track longer service decisions that occur beyond the initial investigation.
- the provincial counts presented in this report are weighted estimates. In some instances sample sizes are too small to derive publishable estimates.
- the OIS only tracks reports investigated by child welfare agencies and does not include reports that were screened out, cases that were only investigated by the police and cases that were never reported.
- the study is based on the assessments provided by the investigating child welfare workers and could not be independently verified.

Analytic Strategies

Ethno-racial data was obtained through publically available data files (Statistics Canada - 2011 National Household Survey, Catalogue Number 99-011-X2011027 and Statistics Canada - 2011 National Household Survey, Catalogue Number 99-010-X2011029) using categories from the National Household Survey 2011 (see:

<https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/nhs-enm/2011/ref/guides/99-010-x/99-010-x2011009-eng.cfm#a2>

minority group. The 'Other' category includes responses such as 'Guyanese,' 'West Indian,' 'Tibetan,' 'Polynesian,' 'Pacific Islander'.

There are several ways to understand and calculate disproportionality and disparity in child welfare services. For the purpose of this analysis, two measures are provided.

First, a disproportionality measure was calculated representing the incidence of child maltreatment-related investigations by ethno-racial category. This measure was calculated by dividing the estimated number of investigations by ethno-racial group, by the number of children in the Ontario population in the ethno-racial group, and multiplying by 1,000 to produce a rate per 1,000 children.

Next a measure of decision-based disparity is provided for investigations, substantiated maltreatment, transfers to ongoing service provision, and placement in out-of-home care. A reminder that the OIS captures decision-making at the initial investigation stage, or in other words approximately 30 to 60 days following referral. Decisions made beyond this point are not captured in these data. Decision based disparity is calculated by (1) dividing the estimated number of children within the ethno-racial category who experienced the disposition (investigation, substantiation, transfer to ongoing services, placement) by the number of children in the ethno-racial category who were investigated and (2) dividing that product by the number of White children who experienced the disposition by the total number of White children who were investigated. Therefore, White children will have a disparity index of 1, while other ethno-racial categories are compared to 1. A finding of more than 1 means that the disposition is more likely for the visible minority group compared to White children. A finding of less than 1 means that the disposition is less likely for the visible minority group than for White children (Shaw, Putnam-Hornstein, Magruder, Needell, 2008).

Findings

Table 1: Estimated Child Maltreatment-Related Investigations (children age 0-14 years of age) by Ethno-Racial Category in Ontario in 2013

Estimated Child Maltreatment-Related Investigations (children age 0-14 years of age) by Ethno-Racial Category in Ontario in 2013

Ethno/Racial Category	# of Investigations	%	NHS 2011 Visible Minority **	% NHS	Rate per 1,000 children	Investigation Disparity (vs. White)	Substantiation Disparity (vs. White)	Transferred Disparity (vs. White)	Placement Disparity (vs. White)
White	76,202	65%	1,401,145	64%	54.39	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00
Black	10,649	9%	141,270	6%	75.38	1.39	1.18	1.08	1.13
Aboriginal*	9,414	8%	74,195	3%	126.88	2.33	1.15	1.41	2.68
Latin American	3,056	3%	29,375	1%	104.02	1.91	1.09	0.77	-
Arab	1,092	1%	37,420	2%	29.19	0.54	0.47	-	-
West Asian	2,507	2%	23,270	1%	107.73	1.98	0.27	-	-
South Asian	5,197	4%	223,925	10%	23.21	0.43	1.09	0.51	-
Chinese	3,852	3%	99,715	5%	38.63	0.71	1.37	0.53	-
Southeast Asian	1,362	1%	26,165	1%	52.07	0.96	1.32	0.80	-
Filipino	1,327	1%	54,010	2%	24.57	0.45	1.33	0.67	-
Japanese	-	0%	5,475	0%	-	-	-	-	-
Korean	373	0%	12,595	1%	29.65	0.55	1.10	-	-
Multiple visible minorities	1,386	1%	32,240	1%	42.98	0.79	1.52	1.33	-
Other	1,511	1%	17,330	1%	87.18	1.60	0.66	0.61	-
Total	118,011	100%	2,178,130	100%	54.18	-	-	-	-

*Aboriginal Identity (8), Age Groups (20), Area of Residence: Inuit Nunangat (7) and Sex (3) for the Population in Private Households of Canada, Provinces and Territories, 2011 National Household Survey

**Visible Minority (35), Generation Status (4), Age Groups (10) and Sex (3) for the Population in Private Households of Canada, Provinces, Territories, Census Metropolitan Areas and Census Agglomerations

empty cells are <100 investigations

Based on a sample of 4,961 child maltreatment-related investigations in 2013 with information about child ethno-racial status, substantiation, transfers and placement

Disproportionality

Several differences in child welfare service decisions by child's ethno-racial category are apparent. Investigations involving White children had a rate of investigation at 54.39 per 1,000 children, which is the overall incidence of investigation for all children age 0-14 years of age. The highest investigation rate per 1,000 children is Aboriginal children, who were investigated at a rate of 126.68 per 1,000 children; nearly 13 per cent of Aboriginal children were the subject of maltreatment-related investigations in Ontario in 2013. Investigations involving West Asian and Latin American children also had a higher rate per 1,000 children than investigations involving White children. Investigations involving "Other" ethno-racial categories had a rate of 87.18 per 1,000 children. Investigations involving Black children had a rate of 75.38 per 1,000 Black children or approximately 8 percent of Black children in Ontario were the subject of a maltreatment-related investigation in Ontario in 2013.

Disparity

The decision-based disparity index, which adjusts for the service population, provides some important information about disparities when examining child welfare service decisions during a child maltreatment-related investigation. Aboriginal children are more than 130 percent more likely to be investigated than a White child (DI=2.33), 15 per cent more likely to be substantiated (DI=1.15), 40 percent more likely to be transferred to ongoing services

(DI=1.41) and 168 percent more likely to be placed in out of home care during the investigation (DI=2.68).

Black children are 40 percent more likely to be investigated compared to White children (DI=1.39), 18 per cent more likely to be substantiated (DI =1.18); 8 percent more likely to be transferred to ongoing services (DI=1.08) and 13 percent more likely to be placed in out of home care during the investigation (DI=1.13). All other ethno-racial categories are less likely to be transferred to ongoing services or placed in out of home care compared to White children with the exception of Multiple Visible Minorities and Other ethno-racial categories. Multiple Visible Minorities are less likely to be investigated compared to White children but more likely to be substantiated, and transferred to service. Investigations involving “Other” ethno-racial categories are more likely to be investigated than White children, less likely to be substantiated and transferred to ongoing services.

References

- Fallon, B., Van Wert, M., Trocmé, N., MacLaurin, B., Sinha, V., Lefebvre, R., et al. (2015). *Ontario Incidence Study of Reported Child Abuse and Neglect 2013: Major Findings*. Child Welfare Research Portal.
- Morton, C. M., Ocasio, K., & Simmel, C. (2011). A critique of methods used to describe the overrepresentation of African Americans in the child welfare system. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 33(9), 1538–1542.
<http://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2011.03.018>
- Shaw, T. V., Putnam-Hornstein, E., Magruder, J., & Needell, B. (2008). Measuring racial disparity in child welfare. *Child Welfare*, 87(2), 23.